

The Correct Citation and Spelling of *Ptiliogonys* and Type Locality of *Ptiliogonys cinereus*

M. RALPH BROWNING

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, National Ecology Research Center, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, D.C. 20560 USA

William Swainson published descriptions and illustrations of many new forms of New World birds. In some of his earlier papers, Swainson cited his own works (of which only some parts had been published) as well as some manuscripts that were never published (see McMillan 1970). Swainson also referred to works that were published later under different titles. For example, Swainson (1827a) listed several names of birds and cited his "Mexican Zoology," a work that was never published. Later he (Swainson 1831-1832) referred to the "Cat. of Mex. Mus. App. p. 4 (1824)," in which he claimed to have described the taxa he had listed in Swainson (1827a).

Modern authorities (e.g. Greenway 1960: 371; American Ornithologists' Union [AOU] 1983: 582) refer to the 1824 source as the original publication for the genus they render as *Ptiliogonys* and (AOU 1983) for the species *Ptiliogonys cinereus*. However, there is no evidence that the 1824 work was ever seen as a manuscript or published. In this paper, I review the use of "Swainson, 1824," as a citation and discuss the actual publication, spelling of the names *Ptiliogonys* and *Ptiliogonys cinereus*, and type locality of the species.

SWAINSON'S 1824 APPENDIX

William Bullock Sr. exhibited in London a collection of specimens and artifacts from Mexico in 1824 (Whitehead 1970, 1971) or 1825 (Honour 1954) and published a catalogue (Bullock 1824a) of the exhibit. The catalogue (see Literature Cited for complete title) was variously cited by earlier authors as "Cat. of Mex. Mus." and "Cat. Bullock's Mex. Mus." until Sherborn (1922) cited it as "Cat. of Exhib. called Modern Mexico."

Swainson studied the collection in 1823 (Stresemann 1975) and probably had an opportunity for further study during the exhibition in 1824-1825. Swainson also had received specimens from William Bullock Sr. that were collected in Mexico by his son, William Bullock Jr., from 1823 to 1827 (Stresemann 1954). Bullock Sr. was mentioned only briefly in Swainson's (1825, 1826) early papers. Swainson (1827a: 364) provided "a short synopsis of those birds [from Bullock] which have reached me up to this time; indulging the hope of giving a more detailed account hereafter of the zoology of Mexico, accompanied by coloured figures." In July 1827, Swainson (1827b) stated that the specimens he was describing were available from "the Ornithological discoveries of Mr. Bullock. . ."

It should be noted that, when Swainson (1827a: 368) first proposed *Ptiliogonys* and described the species *P.*

cinereus (May 1827), he indicated that this was first described in "Swainson in Zool. Journ. [article] No. 10." This (Swainson 1827b) appeared as article number 15 in July 1827. Although Swainson had written and submitted the July paper prior to that of May, the former's publication was delayed. The difference in the issue dates of the two 1827 papers was apparently ignored by Swainson (1832-1833, 1837, 1838), who continued to refer to the July paper (Swainson 1827b) as the source for the name *Ptiliogonys*.

Swainson's first and only mention of Bullock's (1824a) catalogue was made in 1831 when Parts 11-18 (plates 45-85) of his *Zoological illustrations* were issued (Zimmer 1926). There, Swainson (1831-1832, accompanying text to pl. 62) listed "*Ptiliogonys cinereus*. Cat. of Mex. Mus. App. p. 4 (1824)" [referred to here henceforth as the Appendix] and stated that the birds he described in July 1827 (i.e. Swainson 1827b) ". . . were long ago named and characterized by us. Our list, indeed, of all those brought over by Mr. Bullock, was printed with the catalogue, in 1824. . . ." Swainson (1832-1833: 102) also stated that the description of *Ptiliogonys* was based on a female "sent to us from Mexico, by the late Mr. Bullock." No reference to the Appendix to Bullock's catalogue was made by Swainson in his papers after 1831-1832.

Audubon (1839) was the first author after Swainson to use *Ptiliogonys* (in combination as *Ptiliogonys townsendi* [= *Myadestes townsendi*]). He attributed the generic name to Swainson but did not provide a reference for its source. The earliest references to Swainson's supposed Appendix were by Gray (1841), Tschudi (1844), Bonaparte (1850), and Cabanis (1850), all of whom listed the name *Ptiliogonys* (or *Ptiliogonys*) followed by "Swainson, 1824." With the exception of Sclater (1862) and Sharpe (1885), both of whom incorrectly cited Swainson 1827 (i.e. 1827b, not 1827a), authors have consistently given the Appendix as the original citation for *Ptiliogonys* and *P. cinereus*.

The only basis for the existence of the Appendix to Bullock's catalogue is Swainson's (1831-1832) reference to it. Compilations by the Royal Society of London (1871) and Coues (1878) did not list the Appendix as a publication. Waterhouse (1889), librarian to the Zoological Society of London (of which Swainson was a charter member in 1825 [Bastin 1970]), listed the genus as "*Ptiliogonys* Swains. Cat. of Bullock's Mexican Mus., Appendix, p. 4 (1824)," but indicated that he did not personally verify the reference. The mention of the Appendix in a copy of Waterhouse's work at the Smithsonian Institution is followed by a penciled question mark, possibly by R. Ridgway or

C. W. Richmond. Sherborn (1922), who examined four variant copies of Bullock's (1824a) catalogue, did not find an Appendix. Furthermore, neither Zimmer (1926) nor Wood (1931) listed Swainson's Appendix to Bullock's (1824a) catalogue. Ridgway (1904: 114, 115) referred to the Appendix in quotation marks, and Hellmayr (1935) and Greenway (1960) doubted the Appendix as the valid source for *Ptiliogonys*. Modern bibliographic studies by McMillan (1970, 1976), Jackson (1975), and Knight (1986) did not include the Appendix as a publication by Swainson. Furthermore, Swainson published on birds only once in 1824 (Swainson 1824), but he did not discuss silky-flycatchers.

A copy of Bullock's (1824a) catalogue in the Smithsonian Collection, Smithsonian Institution Library, contains general descriptions of the birds exhibited by Bullock. None of the brief descriptions, which lack scientific names, can be construed to refer to a silky-flycatcher. Unlike the other sections of the catalogue, the section on birds contains several references to "Mr. Bullock," which suggests that someone other than Bullock, perhaps Swainson, wrote the description of the exhibited birds. The section on the birds ends with an announcement that "Mr. Swainson has been some time engaged in preparing a work on the Zoology of Mexico, wherein these birds will be more particularly described." There is no appendix to the Smithsonian copy of Bullock's (1824a) catalogue.

In conclusion, I found no evidence that Swainson's Appendix to Bullock's (1824a) catalogue ever existed as a manuscript or that it was published. Therefore, the names *Ptiliogonys* and *Ptiliogonys cinereus* based on "Swainson, 1824" are not available (International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature 1985, Art. 8), because there is no evidence that the work was published.

CORRECT SPELLING AND CITATION OF THE GENERIC NAME

Of several names available to represent the genus of silky-flycatchers, the earliest is *Ptiliogonys* Swainson, 1827. Swainson used this and variant spellings in his later publications, usually in combination with the specific name *cinereus*, as follows:

Ptiliogonys Swainson, (May) 1827, *Philos. Mag.*, n. s. 1 (fasc. 5), p. 368

Ptiliogonatus Swainson, (July) 1827, *Zool. Journ.* 3 (Art. 15), p. 164

Ptiliogonys Swainson, 1831, *Zool. Illus.*, pl. 62

Ptiliogonys Swainson, 1833, *Zool. Illus.*, pl. 102

Ptilogonys Swainson, 1837, *Nat. Hist. and Classif.*, Vol. 2, p. 224, index (spelled *Ptiliogonys* on p. 6)

Ptilogonys Swainson, 1838, *Animals Menag.*, p. 285

Strickland (1841), who reviewed Gray (1840), remarked that the spelling of the genus should be *Ptiliogonys*. Gray (1841) followed the suggested correction, but authors since then have spelled the name

either as *Ptiliogonys* or *Ptilogonys*. Ridgway (1887) was the last author to use the original spelling, *Ptiliogonys*. Swainson, who never provided an etymology for the name of this genus, gave "knees feathered" as a character (Swainson 1827b). Thus, the generic name would seem to be from the Greek *ptilon*, feather, and the Greek, *gonys*, knee (see Brown 1956, Woods 1966). When these roots are used in combination, the word is correctly spelled *ptilogonys*. Nonetheless, the names used by Swainson after the first publication (1827a) are incorrect subsequent spellings and have no nomenclatural standing (I.C.Z.N. 1985: art. 32).

The correct citation of the genus is as follows: *Ptiliogonys* Swainson, (May) 1827, *Philos. Mag.*, n. s. 1 (fasc. 5), p. 368. Type by monotypy, *Ptiliogonys cinereus* Swainson, 1827.

The publication for the source of *Ptiliogonys cinereus* was incorrectly given by Greenway (1960) as "1827, London, Edinb. *Dubl. Phil. Mag.*, n. s. 1, p. 368." That journal title refers to the *London, Edinburgh, and Dublin Philosophical Magazine and Journal of Science*, which was published only from 1840 to 1850 (see Bolton 1897). The first description of *P. cinereus* was published in the journal known simply as *The Philosophical Magazine*. Therefore, the species should have the same citation as the genus.

THE TYPE LOCALITY OF *P. CINEREUS*

The range of *P. cinereus* was given by Swainson (1827a) as "Table land of Mexico. Real del Monte." Ridgway (1904) considered the "Table Land" of Mexico as the type locality, and Hellmayr (1935) gave it only as Mexico. The locality Real del Monte, in the state of Hidalgo (given as Rio del Monte in Sharpe [1906]) was, perhaps, not considered as the type locality by those authors. This is because it was known that William Bullock Sr. (1824b) never visited there, *contra* Brodtkorb (1944). However, William Bullock Jr., who remained in Mexico until at least 1827 and collected with Ferdinand Deppe in the table lands of Mexico (Stresemann 1954), did visit Real del Monte (Swainson 1827b). Either of the Bullocks also may have received specimens from Real del Monte sent by a Mr. Morgan or a geologist named John Taylor. Taylor visited Real del Monte sometime between 1822 and 1823 (Dahlgren 1887: 204-205), and he is known to have communicated later with the mining companies there for several years (Taylor 1838). Swainson (*in* Swainson and Richardson 1832) had access to specimens from John Taylor's Mexican collection, which consisted of at least 21 birds that "were examined and said to be described by Mr. Swainson" (Sharpe 1906: 497). Swainson (1832-1833, opposite Pl. 102) described a male of *P. cinereus* received from John Taylor that Mr. Morgan collected at Real del Monte.

Nonetheless, Moore (1935) stated that "It is quite probable that my fresh specimens [of *P. cinereus*] from Temascaltepec (an old locality of Swainson) are to-

potypical and I suggest that the 'table lands of Mexico' of the original description be restricted to Temascaltepec." Both Bullocks visited Temascaltepec (Stresemann 1954) as well as other localities of the table land. Miller et al. (1957), Greenway (1960), and the AOU (1983) followed Moore's (1935) restriction of the type locality of *cinereus*. On the other hand, Phillips (1966) gave the type locality as "'Mexico' [=Distrito Federal?]."

According to Brodtkorb (1944), Sibley (1950), and Pitelka (1961), there are reasons to doubt some of the type localities given by Swainson. However, several names proposed by Swainson have Real del Monte as their presently accepted type locality. Furthermore, it is quite clear that Swainson and Bullock (1824b) used the term "table land" as a region of Mexico rather than as a specific locality. Moore's (1935) rejection of the general locality of "table land of Mexico" is reasonable; however, to restrict a type locality on the basis of specimens on hand and ignore more specific locality information is hardly justified. Moore's statement does not negate the fact that Swainson gave a specific locality for *cinereus* in the original description (Swainson 1827a). The indefinite locality given by Phillips (1966) is likewise unacceptable. The type locality of *Ptiliogonys cinereus* should be Real (sometimes rendered Mineral) del Monte, Hidalgo [20°08'N, 98°40'W], Mexico.

I thank the staff of the Smithsonian Institution libraries for making available the many rare works I consulted. I also thank Storrs L. Olson for technical advice. Leslie K. Overstreet and Robert W. Storer read an earlier version of this paper. I am grateful to Richard C. Banks, who offered many valuable suggestions, and to John P. Hubbard, and Burt L. Monroe Jr., who read the present version.

LITERATURE CITED

- AMERICAN ORNITHOLOGISTS' UNION. 1983. Check-list of North American birds, sixth ed. Washington, D.C., Am. Ornithol. Union.
- AUDUBON, J. J. 1839. Ornithological biography, vol. 5. Edinburgh, Adam and Charles Black.
- BASTIN, J. 1970. The first prospectus of the Zoological Society of London: new light on the Society's origins. *J. Soc. Bibliog. nat. Hist.* 5(5): 369-388.
- BOLTON, H. C. 1897. A catalogue of scientific and technical periodicals. *Smithsonian Misc. Coll.* Vol. 40.
- BONAPARTE, C. L. 1850. *Conspectus generum avium*, vol. 1. Lugduni Batavorum apud E. J. Brill, Academiae Typographum, Leyden.
- BRODKORB, P. 1944. The type localities of some Mexican birds of the genera *Aphelocoma*, *Cyancitta*, and *Peucedramus*. *Auk* 61: 400-404.
- BROWN, R. W. 1956. Composition of scientific words. Rev. ed. London, privately publ.
- BULLOCK, W. 1824a. A descriptive catalogue of the exhibition, entitled ancient and modern Mexico; containing a panoramic view of the present city, specimens of the natural history of New Spain, models of its vegetable produce, habitations, costumes, &c. &c. and of the colossal and enormous idols, the great calendar and sacrificial stones, temples, pyramids, and other existing antique remains. The whole forming the rationally instructive and interesting exhibition, which is now open, for public inspection, at the Egyptian Hall, Piccadilly. Printed for the Proprietors, London. iv, [5].
- . 1824b. Six months residence and travels in Mexico . . . London, John Murray.
- CABANIS, J. 1850. *Museum Heineanum*. Pt. 1, Halberstadt. Pp. 1-106.
- COUES, E. 1878. Faunal publications relating to North America. Pp. 567-784 in *Dep. Interior, U.S. Geol. Surv. Terr., Misc. Publ.* No. 11.
- DAHLGREN, C. B. 1887. *Minas históricas República Mexicana*. México, Oficina Tipografica Secretaria de Fomento.
- GRAY, G. R. 1840. A list of the genera of birds . . . London, Richard and John E. Taylor.
- . 1841. A list of the genera of birds . . . Second ed. London, Richard and J. C. Taylor.
- GREENWAY, J. C., JR. 1960. Family Bombycillidae. Pp. 369-373 in *Check-list of birds of the World*, vol. 9 (E. Mayr and J. C. Greenway Jr., Eds.). Cambridge, Massachusetts, Mus. Comp. Zool.
- HELLMAYR, C. E. 1935. *Catalogue of birds of the Americas*. *Field Mus Nat. Hist Publ., Zool. Ser.* 13, Pt. 8.
- HONOUR, H. 1954. *Curiosities of the Egyptian Hall*. *Country Life* 115: 38-39.
- INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE. 1985. *International Code on Zoological Nomenclature*, third ed. London, Int. Trust Nomencl., British Mus. (Nat. Hist.).
- JACKSON, C. E. 1975. *Bird illustrators: some artists in early lithography*. London, H. F. and G. Witherby Ltd.
- KNIGHT, D. M. 1986. William Swainson: naturalist, author, and illustrator. *Arch. Nat. Hist.* 13(3): 275-290.
- MCMILLAN, N. F. 1970. William Swainson's *Birds of Brazil, Mexican Zoology, and Tropical Ornithology*. *J. Soc. Bibliog. nat. Hist.* 5(5): 366-368.
- . 1976. Swainson, William. Pp. 167-168 in *Dictionary of scientific biography*, vol. 13 (C. C. Gillispie, Ed.). New York, Charles Scribner's Sons.
- MILLER, A. H., H. FRIEDMANN, L. GRISCOM, & R. T. MOORE. 1957. *Distributional check-list of the birds of Mexico*, pt. 2. *Pacific Coast Avif.* No. 33.
- MOORE, R. T. 1935. New birds from northwestern Mexico. *Proc. Biol. Soc. Washington* 48: 111-114.
- PHILLIPS, A. R. 1966. Further systematic notes on Mexican birds. *Bull. British Ornithol. Club* 86(7): 125-131.

- PITELKA, F. A. 1961. Comments on types and taxonomy in the jay genus *Aphelocoma*. *Condor* 63(3): 234-245.
- RIDGWAY, R. 1887. A manual of North American birds. Philadelphia, J. B. Lippincott Co.
- . 1904. The birds of North and Middle America, pt. 5. U.S. Natl. Mus. Bull. 50.
- ROYAL SOCIETY OF LONDON. 1871. Catalogue of scientific papers. (1800-1863), vol. 5. R. Soc. London.
- SCLATER, P. L. 1862. Catalogue of a collection of American birds. London, N. Trubner and Co.
- SHARPE, R. B. 1885. Catalogue of the birds in the British Museum, vol. 10. London, British Mus.
- . 1906. The history of the collections contained in the natural history departments of the British Museum. Birds. London, British Mus.
- SHERBORN, C. D. 1922. Index animalium. Second Sect. (Pt. 1). London, Longmans, Green, and Co. vii-cxxx + 128 pp.
- SIBLEY, C. G. 1950. Species formation in the red-eyed towhees of Mexico. *Univ. California Publ. Zool.* 50(2): 109-194.
- STRESEMANN, E. 1954. Ferdinand Deppe's travels in Mexico, 1824-1829. *Condor* 56(1): 86-92.
- . 1975. Ornithology from Aristotle to the present. Cambridge, Harvard Univ. Press.
- STRICKLAND, H. E. 1841. Commentary on Mr. G. R. Gray's "Genera of Birds." 8 vols. London, 1840. *Ann. and Mag. Nat. Hist.* 6(39): 410-423; 7(41): 26-41.
- SWAINSON, W. 1824. An inquiry into the natural affinities of the Lanidae or shrikes; preceded by some observations on the present state of ornithology in this country. *Zool. J.* 1(Art. 42): 289-307.
- . 1825. The characters and descriptions of several birds belonging to the genus *Thamnophilus*. *Zool. J.* 2(Art. 11): 84-93.
- . 1826. On the tyrant shrikes of America. *Q. J. Sci. Lit. Arts. Inst.* 20 (Art. 40): 267-285.
- . 1827a. A synopsis of the birds discovered in Mexico by W. Bullock, F. L. S., and H. S., Mr. William Bullock, jun. *Phil. Mag.*, n. s. 1(5): 364-369; 433-442.
- . 1827b. On several groups and forms in ornithology, not hitherto defined. *Zool. J.* 3(Art. 15): 158-175; 343-363.
- . 1831-1832. Zoological illustrations, or original figures and descriptions of new, rare, or interesting animals, selected chiefly from the classes of ornithology, entomology, and conchology, and arranged according to their apparent affinities. Second Ser., Vol. 2. London, Baldwin, Cradock, and R. Havell. Pls. 46-91 + accompanying text.
- . 1832-1833. Zoological illustrations. . . (complete title same as preceding). Second Ser., Vol. 3. London, Baldwin, Cradock, and R. Havell. Pls. 92-136 + accompanying text.
- . 1837. On the natural history and classification of birds, vol. 2. Lardner's Cabinet Cyclopaedia. London, Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, Green, Longman, and J. Taylor.
- . 1838. Animals in menageries. Lardner's Cabinet Cyclopaedia. London, Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, Green, Longman, and J. Taylor.
- , & J. RICHARDSON. 1832. Fauna Boreali-Americana. Pt. 2. The Birds. London, John Murray.
- TAYLOR, J. 1838. A note to accompany specimens of quicksilver ore from the mine San Onofre, near the town of El Doctor, Mexico. *Proc. Geol. Soc. London* 2(38): 686.
- TSCHUDI, J. J. VON. 1844. Avium conspectus quo in Republica Peruana reperiunter et pleraeque observatae vel collectae sunt in itinere. *Arch. Naturg.* 10(1): 262-317.
- WATERHOUSE, F. H. 1889. Index generum avium. London, R. H. Porter.
- WHITEHEAD, P. J. P. 1970. Zoological specimens from Cook's voyages. *J. Soc. Bibliog. nat. Hist.* 5(3): 161-201.
- . 1971. Museums in the history of zoology. Pt. 2. *Museums J.* 70(4): 155-160.
- WOOD, C. A. 1931. An introduction to the literature of vertebrate zoology based chiefly on titles in the Blacker Library of Zoology. London, Oxford Univ. Press.
- WOODS, R. S. 1966. An English-classical dictionary for the use of taxonomist. Claremont, Pomona College.
- ZIMMER, J. T. 1926. Catalogue of the Edward E. Ayer Ornithological Library. Pt. 2. *Field Mus. Nat. Hist. Zool. Ser.*, Vol. 11: 365-706.

Received 12 January 1989, accepted 31 May 1989.